

1 HON. RICARDO S. MARTINEZ
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

C.S., by and through his parents and
guardians, S.S. and K.S.; and D.Z., by and
through his parents and guardians, E.Z.
and J.Z., each individually, on behalf of
similarly situated individuals, and on
behalf of THE BOEING COMPANY
MASTER WELFARE PLAN,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE BOEING COMPANY MASTER
WELFARE PLAN, and THE BOEING
COMPANY EMPLOYEE BENEFIT PLANS
COMMITTEE,

Defendants.

NO. 2:14-cv-00574-RSM

ORDER:

- (1) GRANTING FINAL APPROVAL OF
SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT; AND
- (2) APPROVING AND DIRECTING
DISBURSEMENTS FROM
QUALIFIED SETTLEMENT TRUST
FUND

Upon consideration of Plaintiffs' unopposed motion pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(e) for an order approving the settlement of this Action (the "Motion for Final Approval"), in accordance with the Parties' Settlement Agreement dated as of June 5, 2015 (the "Agreement"), which together with the Appendices annexed thereto sets forth the terms and conditions for a settlement of the Action, and the Court having read and considered the Agreement, enters the following findings:

20
21
22
23
24
25
26
ORDER APPROVING
SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT, ETC.- 1
[Case No. 2:14-cv-00574-RSM]

SIRIANNI YOUTZ
SPOONEMORE HAMBURGER
999 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 3650
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104
TEL. (206) 223-0303 FAX (206) 223-0246

1 1. The Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Lawsuit, the
2 Named Plaintiffs, the Class Members, and Defendants pursuant to 29 U.S.C. § 1132(e).

3 2. The Agreement, together with all of its exhibits, is incorporated herein,
4 and to the extent not otherwise defined herein, all capitalized words, terms, and
5 phrases used herein shall have the same meaning as used in the Agreement.

6 3. The Settlement Class is that defined and preliminary certified by the
7 Court for settlement purposes only under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(b)(1) on June 9, 2015 (Dkt.
8 No. 36).

9 4. The Court finds that the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure
10 23 and due process have been satisfied in connection with the distribution of the notice
11 to class members. The record reflects that the Claims Processor mailed 1,428 approved
12 notices and claims material to participants or beneficiaries enrolled in a self-funded
13 health coverage option during the class period who have an Autism diagnosis and
14 made a claim for any Autism treatment provided while they were Washington State
15 residents ("Notices"). Dkt. No. 37. The Court finds that direct mail notice to class
16 members was the best notice practical, and meets the requirements of due process.

17 5. The Court further finds that appropriate notice to state and federal
18 official was provided pursuant to the Class Action Fairness Act of 2005 ("CAFA"), 28
19 U.S.C. § 1715. The Court also finds that Defendants have fully satisfied their
20 obligations under CAFA.

21 6. The Class Processor did not receive any objections or comments to the
22 Agreement.

23 7. Based on the record before it, the Court finds, pursuant to Federal Rule of
24 Civil Procedure 23(e), that the Agreement attached as Appendix 1 to the Motion for
25 Preliminary Approval is fair, reasonable, and adequate. The Court finds that: (a) the
26 Agreement resulted from extensive arm's length negotiations; (b) there is no evidence

1 of fraud, collusion, or overreaching or that the rights of absent Class Members were
 2 disregarded; and (c) counsel has sufficient experience in similar litigation to propose
 3 and recommend the Agreement. The Court further finds that the Agreement includes
 4 Coverage Agreements pertaining to ABA therapy to treat ASD as set forth in
 5 Paragraph 6 of the Agreement. The Court also finds that the Agreement provides
 6 significant retrospective relief in that class members with approved claims will receive
 7 full reimbursement for unpaid ABA claims during the class period.

8 8. From the outset of this case, the Settlement Class faced and continues to
 9 face numerous affirmative defenses and litigation risks that could create a complete bar
 10 to recovery or leave Class Members with a recovery less than that presented under the
 11 Agreement. The Agreement is fair and reasonable under the circumstances. Therefore,
 12 the Agreement is approved under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(e).

13 9. The Court authorizes the payment of approved class member claims in
 14 this action. The Claims Processor is directed to pay all valid claims from the Qualified
 15 Settlement Trust Fund. There is a dispute over whether a late claim is valid. If
 16 informal resolution is not possible, then the parties will seek resolution of the dispute.

17 10. Class Counsel have sought an attorneys' fees award, exclusive of costs
 18 and expenses, in an amount equal to 25% of the Settlement Amount, i.e., \$225,000, and
 19 reimbursement for out-of-pocket litigation costs incurred totaling \$9,737.45.

20 11. The Court approves class counsel request for attorneys' fees totaling
 21 \$225,000. No Class Member has objected to this amount, which is evidence that the
 22 Class Members find the request to be fair. This amount is fair and reasonable. This
 23 award also results in a multiplier of 1.59, which is within an acceptable range. *See*
 24 *Vizcaino v. Microsoft*, 290 F.3d 1043, 1051 (9th Cir. 2002) (multiplier of 3.65 "was within
 25 the range of multipliers applied in common fund cases"). The Court awards these
 26 attorneys' fees to Class Counsel for its efforts in this action, and authorizes and directs

ORDER APPROVING
 SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT, ETC.- 3
 [Case No. 2:14-cv-00574-RSM]

SIRIANNI YOUTZ
 SPOONEMORE HAMBURGER
 999 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 3650
 SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104
 TEL. (206) 223-0303 FAX (206) 223-0246

1 the disbursement of \$225,000 from the Qualified Settlement Trust Fund to Class
2 Counsel.

3 12. The Court also approves Class Counsel's request for reimbursement of
4 \$9,737.45 in litigation costs. These costs were documented, are reasonable, and were
5 necessary to advance the interests of the class. No Class Member has objected to Class
6 Counsel's request for reimbursement of litigation costs. In addition to the fees, the
7 Court also authorizes and directs the disbursement of \$9,737.45 from the Qualified
8 Settlement Trust Fund to Class Counsel as litigation costs in this matter.

9 13. The Court approves the payment of incentive awards to the two class
10 representatives. S.S. and K.S., the parents and guardians of C.S., are awarded \$10,000
11 as an incentive award. E.Z. and J.Z., the parents and guardians of D.Z., are also
12 awarded \$10,000 as an incentive award. The Court authorizes and directs the
13 disbursement of \$10,000 to each of the two families from the Qualified Settlement Trust
14 Fund.

15 14. The Released Claims, as defined in the Agreement, are released and
16 discharged as of the Effective Date of the Agreement. The Named Plaintiffs on behalf
17 of themselves and, to the full extent permitted by law, on behalf of the Class Members,
18 are enjoined and barred from commencing or prosecuting, either directly or indirectly
19 any of the Released Claims against any Releasee directly, representatively,
20 derivatively, or in any other capacity, whether by a complaint, counterclaim, defense,
21 or otherwise, in any local, state, or federal court, or in any agency or other authority or
22 forum, where located.

23 15. Defendants, upon the Effective Date of the Agreement, have released and
24 discharged the Named Plaintiffs, the Settlement Class, and Class Counsel from any and
25 all claims based on the institution or prosecution of the Action.

1 16. The Court recognizes that Defendants have denied and continue to deny
 2 Named Plaintiffs' and Class Members' claims. Neither the Agreement, this Final
 3 Approval Order, the Preliminary Approval Order, drafts of such orders, any papers
 4 related to the Agreement, nor the fact of the Agreement shall be used as a finding or
 5 conclusion of the Court, or an admission of Defendants or The Boeing Company, or
 6 any other person or entity, of any fault, omission, mistake, or liability, nor as evidence
 7 of Named Plaintiffs' or any Class Member's lack of conviction in the validity or
 8 strength of their claims, and shall not be offered as evidence of any claimed liability in
 9 this or any other proceeding. Evidence of the Agreement and the orders of this Court
 10 approving same shall be admissible only in proceedings to enforce the Agreement or
 11 this Order, but not as admission of liability in the underlying Action. This Order is not
 12 a finding of the validity or invalidity of any of the claims asserted or defenses raised in
 13 this Action.

14 17. Class counsel is directed to submit a final report to the Court regarding
 15 claims processing and disbursement of funds from the Qualified Settlement Fund,
 16 which shall be no later than 30 days after the Claims Processor processes all valid
 17 claims. Within 60 days after the submission of this report, the Claim Processor shall
 18 cause the Qualified Settlement Fund to return to The Boeing Company any remaining
 19 funds in the Qualified Settlement Fund, minus any court-approved or agreed holdback
 20 for expenses incurred by not yet paid, taxes, and estimated administrative expenses
 21 necessary to complete the activities of, and close the Qualified Settlement Fund. Any
 22 part of the holdback remaining after all expenses and other liabilities of the Qualified
 23 Settlement Fund are paid shall be returned to The Boeing Company upon closure of the
 24 Qualified Settlement Fund.

1 It is so ORDERED this 9 day of November 2015.
2
3



4
5 RICARDO S. MARTINEZ
6 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
7

8 Agreed and Presented by:
9

10 SIRIANNI YOUTZ
11 SPOONEMORE HAMBURGER
12

13 /s/ Richard E. Spoonemore

14 Richard E. Spoonemore (WSBA #21833)
15 Eleanor Hamburger (WSBA #26478)

16 Attorneys for Plaintiffs
17

18 MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP
19

20 /s/ Jeremy P. Blumenfeld

21 Jeremy P. Blumenfeld (*admitted pro hac vice*)
22 Nicole A. Diller (*admitted pro hac vice*)
23 Roberta H. Vespremi (*admitted pro hac vice*)
24

25 RIDDELL WILLIAMS, P.S.
26

27 /s/ Laurence A. Shapero

28 Laurence A. Shapero (WSBA #31301)
29

30 Attorneys for Defendants
31

32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
5510
5511
5512
5513
5514
5515
5516
5517
5518
5519
5520
5521
5522
5523
5524
5525
5526
5527
5528
5529
55210
55211
55212
55213
55214
55215
55216
55217
55218
55219
55220
55221
55222
55223
55224
55225
55226
55227
55228
55229
55230
55231
55232
55233
55234
55235
55236
55237
55238
55239
55240
55241
55242
55243
55244
55245
55246
55247
55248
55249
55250
55251
55252
55253
55254
55255
55256
55257
55258
55259
55260
55261
55262
55263
55264
55265
55266
55267
55268
55269
55270
55271
55272
55273
55274
55275
55276
55277
55278
55279
55280
55281
55282
55283
55284
55285
55286
55287
55288
55289
55290
55291
55292
55293
55294
55295
55296
55297
55298
55299
552100
552101
552102
552103
552104
552105
552106
552107
552108
552109
552110
552111
552112
552113
552114
552115
552116
552117
552118
552119
552120
552121
552122
552123
552124
552125
552126
552127
552128
552129
552130
552131
552132
552133
552134
552135
552136
552137
552138
552139
552140
552141
552142
552143
552144
552145
552146
552147
552148
552149
552150
552151
552152
552153
552154
552155
552156
552157
552158
552159
552160
552161
552162
552163
552164
552165
552166
552167
552168
552169
552170
552171
552172
552173
552174
552175
552176
552177
552178
552179
552180
552181
552182
552183
552184
552185
552186
552187
552188
552189
552190
552191
552192
552193
552194
552195
552196
552197
552198
552199
552200
552201
552202
552203
552204
552205
552206
552207
552208
552209
552210
552211
552212
552213
552214
552215
552216
552217
552218
552219
552220
552221
552222
552223
552224
552225
552226
552227
552228
552229
5522210
5522211
5522212
5522213
5522214
5522215
5522216
5522217
5522218
5522219
5522220
5522221
5522222
5522223
5522224
5522225
5522226
5522227
5522228
5522229
55222210
55222211
55222212
55222213
55222214
55222215
55222216
55222217
55222218
55222219
55222220
55222221
55222222
55222223
55222224
55222225
55222226
55222227
55222228
55222229
552222210
552222211
552222212
552222213
552222214
552222215
552222216
552222217
552222218
552222219
552222220
552222221
552222222
552222223
552222224
552222225
552222226
552222227
552222228
552222229
5522222210
5522222211
5522222212
5522222213
5522222214
5522222215
5522222216
5522222217
5522222218
5522222219
5522222220
5522222221
5522222222
5522222223
5522222224
5522222225
5522222226
5522222227
5522222228
5522222229
55222222210
55222222211
55222222212
55222222213
55222222214
55222222215
55222222216
55222222217
55222222218
55222222219
55222222220
55222222221
55222222222
55222222223
55222222224
55222222225
55222222226
55222222227
55222222228
55222222229
552222222210
552222222211
552222222212
552222222213
552222222214
552222222215
552222222216
552222222217
552222222218
552222222219
552222222220
552222222221
552222222222
552222222223
552222222224
552222222225
552222222226
552222222227
552222222228
552222222229
5522222222210
5522222222211
5522222222212
5522222222213
5522222222214
5522222222215
5522222222216
5522222222217
5522222222218
5522222222219
5522222222220
5522222222221
5522222222222
5522222222223
5522222222224
5522222222225
5522222222226
5522222222227
5522222222228
5522222222229
55222222222210
55222222222211
55222222222212
55222222222213
55222222222214
55222222222215
55222222222216
55222222222217
55222222222218
55222222222219
55222222222220
55222222222221
55222222222222
55222222222223
55222222222224
55222222222225
55222222222226
55222222222227
55222222222228
55222222222229
552222222222210
552222222222211
552222222222212
552222222222213
552222222222214
552222222222215
552222222222216
552222222222217
552222222222218
552222222222219
552222222222220
552222222222221
552222222222222
552222222222223
552222222222224
552222222222225
552222222222226
552222222222227
552222222222228
552222222222229
5522222222222210
5522222222222211
5522222222222212
5522222222222213
5522222222222214
5522222222222215
5522222222222216
5522222222222217
5522222222222218
5522222222222219
5522222222222220
5522222222222221
5522222222222222
5522222222222223
5522222222222224
5522222222222225
5522222222222226
5522222222222227
5522222222222228
5522222222222229
55222222222222210
55222222222222211
55222222222222212
55222222222222213
55222222222222214
55222222222222215
55222222222222216
55222222222222217
55222222222222218
55222222222222219
55222222222222220
55222222222222221
55222222222222222
55222222222222223
55222222222222224
55222222222222225
55222222222222226
55222222222222227
55222222222222228
55222222222222229
552222222222222210
552222222222222211
552222222222222212
552222222222222213
552222222222222214
552222222222222215
552222222222222216
552222222222222217
552222222222222218
552222222222222219
552222222222222220
552222222222222221
552222222222222222
552222222222222223
552222222222222224
552222222222222225
552222222222222226
552222222222222227
552222222222222228
552222222222222229
5522222222222222210
5522222222222222211
5522222222222222212
5522222222222222213
5522222222222222214
5522222222222222215
5522222222222222216
5522222222222222217
5522222222222222218
5522222222222222219
5522222222222222220
5522222222222222221
5522222222222222222
5522222222222222223
5522222222222222224
5522222222222222225
5522222222222222226
5522222222222222227
5522222222222222228
5522222222222222229
55222222222222222210
55222222222222222211
55222222222222222212
55222222222222222213
55222222222222222214
55222222222222222215
55222222222222222216
55222222222222222217
55222222222222222218
55222222222222222219
55222222222222222220
55222222222222222221
55222222222222222222
55222222222222222223
55222222222222222224
55222222222222222225
55222222222222222226
55222222222222222227
55222222222222222228
55222222222222222229
552222222222222222210
552222222222222222211
552222222222222222212
552222222222222222213
552222222222222222214
552222222222222222215
552222222222222222216
552222222222222222217
552222222222222222218
552222222222222222219
552222222222222222220
552222222222222222221
552222222222222222222
552222222222222222223
552222222222222222224
552222222222222222225
552222222222222222226
552222222222222222227
552222222222222222228
552222222222222222229
5522222222222222222210
5522222222222222222211
5522222222222222222212
5522222222222222222213
5522222222222222222214
5522222222222222222215
5522222222222222222216
5522222222222222222217
5522222222222222222218
5522222222222222222219
5522222222222222222220
5522222222222222222221
5522222222222222222222
5522222222222222222223
5522222222222222222224
5522222222222222222225
5522222222222222222226
5522222222222222222227
5522222222222222222228
5522222222222222222229
55222222222222222222210
55222222222222222222211
55222222222222222222212
55222222222222222222213
55222222222222222222214
55222222222222222222215
55222222222222222222216
55222222222222222222217
55222222222222222222218
55222222222222222222219
55222222222222222222220
55222222222222222222221
55222222222222222222222
55222222222222222222223
55222222222222222222224
55222222222222222222225
55222222222222222222226
55222222222222222222227
55222222222222222222228
55222222222222222222229
552222222222222222222210
552222222222222222222211
552222222222222222222212
552222222222222222222213
552222222222222222222214
552222222222222222222215
552222222222222222222216
552222222222222222222217
552222222222222222222218
552222222222222222222219
552222222222222222222220
552222222222222222222221
55222